

Reading Charlemagne in Outremer

Laura K. Morreale

(Affiliated Scholar, Harvard University, Department of History &
Fordham University, Center for Medieval Studies)
lmorreale3@gmail.com

Who will dare to preach and speak of God any more in square or cloister, and announce benefits and indulgences, [*when no-one is disposed to perform*] anything which can assist Our Lord to conquer and win back the land where He paid our ransom with His blood? Lord prelates, it is neither good nor just that you so delay helping Him: you, this can certainly be said, have made Roland of God and Ganelon of yourselves.

From “Jerusalem se plaint et li país” by Huon de Saint-Quentin, 13th century.¹

As the lyrics of Huon de Saint-Quentin suggest, Charlemagne’s name and those of his household, including Roland and Ganelon, were easily recognized among Latin Christians living in the lands of the Levant during the crusading period, from the early twelfth until the late fifteenth century. Previous studies of Outremer literary culture have pieced together circumstantial evidence to claim that works from the *matière de France* and the Charlemagne-centered *Cycle du Roi* formed the basis for a cohesive cultural identity for Western Christians living in the East.² However, at the same moment works belonging to the *matière de France* were flourishing in the West, scant evidence remains that these same texts were produced, copied, or circulated in Outremer.³ The near absence of these works or of the Frankish king in the eastern repertoire more generally highlights how writing and reading in Outremer followed a trajectory independent from these same activities in the West.

¹ Huon de Saint-Quentin, “Jerusalem se plaint et li país,” trans. Linda Paterson, with Ruth Harvey, available at *Troubadours, Trouvères and the Crusades*, <https://warwick.ac.uk/fac/arts/modernlanguages/research/french/crusades/texts/of/rs1576#page1> (accessed 25 June 2018).

² David Jacoby, “La Littérature française dans les états latins de la Méditerranée orientale à l’époque des croisades: diffusion et création,” in *Essor et fortune de la chanson de geste dans l’Europe et l’Orient latin: actes du IX^e Congrès international de la Société Rencesvals pour l’étude des épopées romanes, Padoue-Venise, 29 août–4 septembre 1982* (Modena: Mucchi, 1984), 617–46.

³ Krijnie Ciggaar, “Manuscripts as Intermediaries: The Crusader States and Literary Cross-Fertilization,” in *East and West in the Crusader States: Context, Contacts, Confrontations: Acta of the Congress Held at Hernen Castle in May 1993*, ed. Krijnie Ciggaar, Adelbert Davids and Herman Teule (Leuven: Uitgeverij Peeters, 1996), 131–51.

The purpose of this essay is to offer a preliminary survey of extant written evidence for the tradition of reading Charlemagne in Outremer during the crusading period. It is based on an examination of three separate yet inter-related repertoires, including the corpus of writings created by authors living in Outremer during the crusader era,⁴ the body of texts produced outside of the Holy Land but found in manuscripts copied or circulated in the East,⁵ and the extended manuscript tradition of a selected number of foundational texts for the Charlemagne story, which will be examined especially for evidence of reception or circulation in the crusader settlements of the Levant.⁶ I hope then to draw some early conclusions about the role the Frankish king, or the memory of the emperor, fulfilled in the written traditions of the Latin East.

Texts Created in the Latin East

Charlemagne was most visible to readers in the East via the well-known historical narratives written by authors in Outremer who recounted the crusading efforts of the late twelfth through early fourteenth centuries. However, as others have noted, crusader historians who composed their histories in the Latin East and made allusion to Charlemagne referred to the emperor only infrequently and never featured him or his followers as characters central to their writings.⁷ The first wave of crusade historians

⁴ A list of texts that form part of this corpus comes from Peter Edbury, “Crusader Sources from the Near East,” in *Byzantines and Crusaders in Non-Greek Sources, 1025–1204*, ed. Mary Whitby (Oxford and New York: Published for the British Academy by Oxford University Press, 2007), 23–38; See also the index of from the French of Outremer site: <https://frenchofoutremer.ace.fordham.edu/index-of-sources/> (accessed 25 June 2018).

⁵ For the corpus of manuscripts from the Latin East, see Hugo Buchta, *Miniature Painting in the Latin Kingdom of Jerusalem* (Oxford: Clarendon, 1957); Jaroslav Folda, *Crusader Illumination at Saint-Jean d'Acre, 1275–1291* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1976); idem, *The Art of the Crusaders in the Holy Land, 1098–1187* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995); idem, “manoscritti miniati negli stati crociati,” in *Le crociate. L'Oriente e l'Occidente da Urbano II a San Luigi, 1096–1270*, ed. M. Rey-Delque (Milan: Electa, 1997), 299–305; Cristina Dondi, *The Liturgy of the Canons Regular of the Holy Sepulchre of Jerusalem. A Study and a Catalogue of the Manuscript Sources* (Turnhout: Brepols, 2004); Online Inventory of the Manuscripts Owned by the Custody of the Holy Land in Jerusalem, <http://www.bibliothecaterraesanctae.org/descrizione-inventario-manoscritti.html> (accessed 25 June 2018).

⁶ For a list of foundational texts, see Thomas F. X. Noble, “Greatness Contested and Confirmed: The Raw Materials of the Charlemagne Legend,” in *The Legend of Charlemagne in the Middle Ages: Power, Faith, and Crusade*, ed. Matthew Gabriele and Jace Stuckey (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2008), 3–21.

⁷ Matthew Gabriele has noted that “there are no extended meditations on Charlemagne in any crusade chronicle and his name is mentioned, briefly, in only a few contemporary sources.” *An Empire of Memory: The Legend of Charlemagne, the Franks, and Jerusalem before the First Crusade* (Oxford and New York: Oxford University Press, 2011), 140. See also Jace Stuckey, “Charlemagne as Crusader? Memory, Propaganda, and the Many Uses of Charlemagne’s Legendary Expedition to Spain,” in *Legend of Charlemagne*, 137–52, at 139.

who did mention Charlemagne most often characterized the emperor as a precursor to those who travelled east on crusade, or as a progenitor of these same warriors whose actions then reappeared in the main part of the narrative, even though the Emperor never made such a journey. The author of the *Gesta Francorum*, for example, explained that Charlemagne paved the way for the crusader armies who, centuries afterwards, followed “the route which Charles the Great, the wondrous king of France, had prepared towards Constantinople.”⁸ William of Tyre, relying on Eckhard’s *Vita Karoli* as a source, noted that Charlemagne established a precedent and even a preference for western rule in the lands of the East among local inhabitants, due to the peace treaty he concluded with Harun al-Rashid, King of Persia. William noted that the relationship between Charlemagne and the inhabitants of Jerusalem was so fruitful that “the gracious favor of that potentate [Charlemagne] was a source of much comfort to the faithful, so that they seemed to be living under the rule of the Emperor Charles rather than under that of Harun.”⁹

Along with citing Charlemagne’s fictional deeds as rationale for western settlers’ actions in the East, First Crusade authors writing in Outremer further defended the newly-arrived westerners by casting Charlemagne as a biological ancestor of those chosen to rule in these new territories. Ralph of Caen, in his *Gesta Tancredi in expeditione Hierosolymitana*, mentioned that the bearing of Baldwin of Boulogne “showed with ease his descent from Charlemagne and that fact that he was born divinely as one who was to take his seat on David’s throne.”¹⁰ Similarly, Bartolf of Nangis concluded his *Gesta Francorum Iherusalem expugnantium* with a set of verses claiming Carolingian parentage for Godfrey of Bouillon and his brother Baldwin through their mother, Ida of Lorraine:

a noble lineage produced both kings,
that is Godfrey and Baldwin.
The mother Ida, to the father Eustace

⁸ *Gesta Francorum et aliorum Hierosolimitanorum*, ed. and trans. Rosalind Hill (London: Thomas Nelson and Sons LTD, 1962), 2: “Isti potentissimi milites et alii plures quos ignoro uenerunt per uiam quam iam dudum Karolus Magnus mirificus rex Franciae aptari fecit usque Constantinopolim.” Questions remain whether this text was created in the East or the West. See Jay Rubenstein, “What is the *Gesta Francorum* and who was Peter Tudebode?” *Revue Mabillon* 16 (2005): 179–204.

⁹ William of Tyre, *A History of Deeds Done Beyond the Beyond the Sea*, ed. and trans. Emily Atwater Babcock and August C. Krey (New York: Columbia University Press, 1943), 64; Einhard, *Vita Karoli Magni*, ed. Oswald Holder-Egger, *Monumenta Germaniae historica. Scriptores rerum Germanicarum in usum scholarum separatim editi*, 25 (Hannover: Hahn, 1911), 19.

¹⁰ Ralph of Caen, *The Gesta Tancredi of Ralph of Caen: A History of the Normans on the First Crusade*, trans. Bernard S. Bachrach and David S. Bachrach (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2005), 61.

Bore these noble princes ruling Jerusalem.
 Let Baldwin, his brother, leader, king of Jerusalem
 Father of the king, king Philip and Robert of Flanders,
 Become after the death of Godfrey, the most unconquered king.
 They were born equally of regal seed.
 The mother Ida descends from the lineage of Charlemagne,
 The sister of the leader Godfrey of renowned Lotharia...¹¹

In many of these twelfth-century eastern texts, Charlemagne served as a carrier of the collective will of the newly arrived Westerners and a justification for their newfound authority in the East. The writer of the mid-twelfth century *Historia Nicaena vel Antiochena* also reiterated the stance of previous eastern authors who had cast Charlemagne as the western Christian subjugator of pagan rule and, by recalling his imagined voyage to Constantinople, the forerunner of western travelers to the East.¹²

As the twelfth century progressed, writers and readers in the East placed more distance between Charlemagne and the lands where Latin Christians had settled. In the late twelfth century, the author of the *Itinerarium peregrinorum et gesta Regis Ricardi* spoke of Charlemagne only metaphorically, arguing that the Bishop of Beauvais, Philippe of Dreux, “would have been the equal of Turpin if he could have found a Charlemagne.”¹³ In book five of the *Itinerarium*, the author noted that Charlemagne conquered many western lands in his fight against paganism, but unlike the early twelfth-century writers who came before him, did not assert that the emperor had taken any such action to further this same cause in the East.¹⁴ In the *Chronique d'Ernoul et de Bernard le Tresorier*, also dating from the late twelfth century, and the *Memoires* of Philip of Novara, written in the early thirteenth, neither author mentioned Charlemagne but rather the most famous members of his household, Roland, Olivier, and in the case of Philip of Novara, Ganelon.¹⁵ In these two works, Roland, Olivier, and

¹¹ Bartolf of Nangis, *Gesta Francorum Iherusalem expugnantium*, in *Recueil des historiens des croisades, historiens occidentaux*, Vol. 3 (Paris: Imprimerie nationale, 1866), 491–543, at 543. Translation by Galina Krasskova.

¹² Baldwin III, *Historia Nicaena vel Antiochena necnon Ierosolymitana*, in *Recueil des historiens des croisades, historiens occidentaux*, Vol. 5 (Paris: Imprimerie nationale, 1895), 133–85, at 142–4.

¹³ *Chronicle of the Third Crusade: A Translation of the Itinerarium peregrinorum et gesta Regis Ricardi*, trans. Helen J. Nicholson (Farnham: Ashgate, 1997), 76.

¹⁴ *Ibid.*, 300.

¹⁵ *Chronique d'Ernoul et de Bernard le Trésorier*, ed. L. de Mas Latrie (Paris: Société de l'histoire de France, 1871), 44; Philippe de Novare, *Mémoires, 1218–1243*, ed. Charles Kohler (Paris: H. Champion, 1913), 40. Philip of Novara also mentions Ganelon in one of his crusader songs, recalling Ganelon as the archetype of a traitor. Philip of Novara, “Nafré sui je, mais encor ne puis taire,” available at *Troubadours, Trouvères and the Crusades*, <http://www2.warwick.ac.uk/fac/arts/modernlanguages/research/french/crusades/texts/of/rs190a/#page1> (accessed 25 June 2018).

Ganelon did not represent real historical actors but served instead as symbols of the adherence to or betrayal of an unstated but understood chivalric ethos.

The distancing of Charlemagne by readers and writers in *Outremer* over the course of the late twelfth to mid-thirteenth centuries is evident in additions made in the Old French translation of William of Tyre's twelfth-century Latin history, sometimes called the *Historie d'Eracles*. Whereas William's Latin original presented Charlemagne as an active force in the East, the French translator added an aside not found in the original, casting the Frankish king as an analog rather than a replacement for Harun al-Rashid. Harun was, argues the Old French writer, "of such nobility and such great generosity and such vitality and such great dealings and all good manners, that they still speak of him throughout all the pagan lands, just as one speaks of the Emperor Charlemagne in France."¹⁶ No longer was Charlemagne a leading force in the East; Charlemagne was instead a literary trope used to communicate the relative value of the eastern king to an audience more familiar with the reputation of the legendary Frankish one.

Charlemagne played a slightly different role in other written genres from *Outremer*, although he and his associates were no less marginalized than in works that shape our understanding of the crusader timeline. Unlike the historical narratives which emphasized the Emperor's fictitious eastern-oriented activities, writings classified as "literary works" emphasized the king's spiritual and temporal authority in the West. In the mid-twelfth century, Rorgo Fretellus of Nazareth painted Charlemagne as a saintly conduit between East and West in his *Description of the Holy Land*, explaining that the relic of the Holy Foreskin was bestowed upon Charlemagne in a temple in Jerusalem "by an angel in heaven,"¹⁷ that the king then transported back to his court in Aachen. The relic, argued the author, was subsequently transferred from Aachen to Charroux, but since Rorgo's family hailed from Poitou,¹⁸ this vignette is perhaps best understood as a comment on the ongoing disputes concerning the authenticity of the Holy Foreskin than a contemporary reading of Charlemagne's role in the East.¹⁹

A second literary work, the *Chanson des Chétifs*, the earliest work in the Old French Crusade Cycle, also presented Charlemagne as a western

¹⁶ *Guillaume de Tyr et ses continuateurs: texte français du XIII^e siècle*, ed. Paulin Paris (Paris: Firmin Didot et Cie, 1879–80), 5–6. William of Tyre's work was first translated into Old French in France, but several copies of the work circulated in the East. Philip Handyside, "L'Estoire d'Eracles in Outremer," in *The French of Outremer: Communities and Communications in the Crusading Mediterranean*, ed. Laura K. Morreale and Nicholas L. Paul (New York: Fordham University Press, 2018), 68–85.

¹⁷ *Rorgo Fretellus de Nazareth et sa description de la Terre Sainte. Histoire et édition du texte*, ed. P. C. Boren (Amsterdam, Oxford and New York: North Holland Publishing Company, 1980), 32.

¹⁸ *Ibid.*, viii–x.

¹⁹ Leonard B. Glick, *Marked in Your Flesh: Circumcision from Ancient Judea to Modern America* (Oxford and New York: Oxford University Press, 2005), 96.

territorial ruler. Although there is some debate as to whether the *Chanson des Chétifs* was indeed produced in the East, evidence suggests that parts of the text were created in Antioch between 1136 and 1149. In the *Chétifs*, Charlemagne's dominion is expressed in dynastic terms located firmly outside of eastern lands and at times in opposition to eastern power constructs.²⁰ When, for example, in chapter sixteen of the *Chétifs*, the Muslim captor Corbaran asks one of his Christian prisoners, "What is your name, my friend?" the knight responds, "My lord, I will tell you straight away: I am called Richard, born in Chaumont, which belonged to King Charlemagne,"²¹ a statement that characterizes Charlemagne first and foremost as a western feudal lord. In a subsequent chapter, Richard's kinship with Charlemagne is highlighted as the most notable component of his identity and his ties to the Christian king, juxtaposed with those who made up the pagan army. The author notes that Richard was "descended from Charlemagne," but identifies members of the opposing army as "the descendants of Mohamed."²² Finally, after Richard and his fellow *chétifs* are granted leave from their captors, members of the newly-freed entourage contemplate whether to visit the Holy Sepulcher or to join a group of fellow warriors, several of whom have western toponymic surnames and are in the same company as "the noble lords from the kingdom of Charlemagne."²³ In these successive excerpts from the *Chanson des Chétifs* and Fretellus's *Description of the Holy Land*, Charlemagne's name was more closely associated with his western territories and descendants than were his activities in the East.

Texts Circulating in the Latin East

Many works that were first written in the West circulated in Outremer alongside those composed by authors in the East. One exception to the near black-out of western Charlemagne-centered texts in Outremer comes from an early twentieth-century discovery of a manuscript bifolium, containing 119 lines of the epic poem, *Fierabras*.²⁴ Originally written in the late twelfth

²⁰ *The Chanson des Chétifs and Chanson de Jérusalem*, trans. Carol Sweetenham (Farnham: Ashgate, 2016), 12–13.

²¹ *Ibid.*, 76.

²² *Ibid.*, 97.

²³ *Ibid.*, 141.

²⁴ Many thanks to Uri Shachar for alerting me to this exception. See Cordula Bandt and Arnd Rattmann, "Die Damaskusreise Bruno Violets 1900/1901 zur Erforschung der Qubbet el-Chazne," *Codices Manuscripti* 32/76–77 (2011): 1–20; Arianna D'Ottone, "Manuscripts as Mirrors of a Multilingual and Multicultural Society: the Case of the Damascus Find," in *Negotiating Co-Existence: Communities, Cultures and "Convivencia" in Byzantine Society*, ed. Barbara Crosini and Sergio LaPorta, (Trier: WVT, Wissenschaftlicher Verlag Trier, 2013), 63–88; Laura Minervini, "Sui frammenti epici della moschea di Damasco (Fierabras, lasse 106–108, 117–118)," in *Codici, testi, interpretazioni: studi sull'epica romanza medievale*, ed. Paolo Di Luca and Dorianna Piacentino (Naples: University Press, 2015), 93–103.

century as part of the *Cycle du Roi*, *Fierabras* recounts the story of the eponymous Saracen giant who fights fiercely against Charlemagne's armies in Spain, but who ultimately converts to Christianity and joins the Emperor's army. The work belongs to a cycle of the relics of the passion, which explains, as did the work of Rorgo Fretellus, how certain relics made their way to Europe from the East via the imaginary travels of the Frankish king.²⁵

The manuscript fragment of this text, found in 1900 in the mosque of Damascus (a multilingual storehouse containing works in Greek, Arabic, Latin, and Old French, among other languages), has since been lost, but the remaining description, transcription, and images of the bifolium reveal that this copy of *Fierabras* was minimally ornamented, contained a complex abbreviation system, and featured several corrections to the original text added in a second hand.²⁶ Laura Minervini has argued that these paleographic traits align with those found often in manuscripts owned and used by *jongleurs*, therefore suggesting both an oral and visual presentation of the *Fierabras* in Outremer.

Charlemagne is mentioned by name three times in the small excerpt, and he is given voice within the text in a direct quotation:

Charles got to his feet, called the Franks to him
 Rainier and Genevois, Alori and Hardré.
 “My Lords,” said Charlemagne, “you have greatly shamed me,
 Who, before me, you have fought and quarreled
 But, by the soul of my father, if it is not set right,
 I will administer such justice for which I will be praised.”

[Karles se drece en pies, s'a François a apelé, Rainier e Genevois,
 Alori et Hardré, Segnor—dist Karlemagnes—moult m'aveé vergondé,
 Qui devant moi vos estes combatus et meslé, Masi par la'ame mon
 pere, se il n'est amendé, J'en ferai tel jostise com moi sera loé].²⁷

The *Fierabras* fragment, in its material realities and in the animation of the king's voice in the excerpt, reveals an oral tradition of the Charlemagne story that co-existed with written works within these eastern environments. Although few traces of the performative norms remain for modern audiences,

²⁵ Marc LePerson, “‘Autour du pont de Mautrible’: souvenirs, mouvances et résurgences de la chanson de Fierabras dans différents genres du domaine français et étranger,” in *La Mémoire à l'oeuvre: fixations et mouvances médiévales*, ed. Caroline Cazanave (Besançon: Presses universitaires de Franche-Comte, 2013), 133–62, at 134. The 'cycle of relics of the passion' is a modern construct that has been useful in discussions such as Le Person's. See, for instance, Marianne Ailes, “Les Reliques dans les chansons de geste,” in *La chanson de geste et le sacre* (Clermont-Ferrand: Presse de l'Université Blaise-Pascal, forthcoming).

²⁶ Minervini, “Sui frammenti,” 96.

²⁷ *Ibid.*, 101.

what has been preserved allows us to contextualize this work and understand the occasional references to Charlemagne found in songs created by eastern writers, including those of Philip of Novara.²⁸ Through this small direct witness to the visual apprehension of the Charlemagne story, we see that “reading” Charlemagne in *Outremer* could well have been an aural as well as a graphic experience.

Two additional thirteenth-century texts first written in the West but circulated in Outremer, the *Image du Monde* by Gautier of Metz and the *Trésor* by Brunetto Latini, featured Charlemagne in one or more chapters. Although the first text is understood as a work of science and the second a philosophical or didactic collection, both presented the king as a protector of the church and a unifying force in western Christendom. In the *Image du Monde*, composed in the mid-thirteenth century, Gautier of Metz explains that Charlemagne took great pains to bring churchmen to France and to keep them in his sphere of influence.²⁹ He notes that

Charlemagne loved philosophy dearly, and promoted it in France with all his might, and kept all the good clerics that he could have with him and sent them everywhere where he knew them. He took great pains and trouble to support holy Christianity. For this reason, he never wanted to permit that the clergy not be kept close.

[Car Charlemaine ama moult philosophie et avança en France de son pouvoir et retenoit touz les bons clers que il povoit avoir avec lui, et les mandoit par tout la ou il les savoit. Mainte paine ot et maint annui pour essaucier sainte crestienté. Ne onques pour ce ne vout lessier que il ne tenist clergie pres].³⁰

Gautier then noted how much the Emperor loved God, what luxurious donations he made to the local churches, and how beloved he was in Lorraine. He closed by claiming that Charlemagne knew that if the clergy were to leave France, members of the nobility would soon follow. In the *Image du Monde*, no mention was made of Charlemagne’s deeds in the East or any place outside of France.

And just as Gautier of Metz presented Charlemagne from his own local perspective, so too did the Florentine Brunetto Latini characterize Charlemagne in his encyclopedic *Trésor*. Among the four manuscripts containing a version of Brunetto Latini’s work which show evidence of

²⁸ See n. 15.

²⁹ Gautier de Metz, *L’image du monde de maître Gossouin: texte du manuscrit de la Bibliothèque nationale, fonds français n° 574*, ed. Oliver Herbert Prior (Lausanne: Imprimeries réunies, 1913), 79.

³⁰ *Ibid.*, 79.

having been copied and circulated in the Latin East,³¹ Charlemagne was mentioned six times, first as one of the kings of France, then as a warrior who subdued several smaller kingdoms in Italy on behalf of the church, and finally as the champion of the Roman Empire.³² Latini explained that

When Charles had conquered all of Lombardy and subjugated the whole land of Italy to himself and to the Holy Church he went to Rome in great triumph. There he was crowned Emperor of the Romans and he held the victories against the Saracens and the enemies of the Holy Church, and subjugated Germany and Spain and many other countries to his rule.

[Et quant Chalres ot toute Lomberdie conquisse et tote la terre de Ytalie souzmisse a soi et a sainte Yglise, il ala a Rome ou granz triomphes. La fu il coronez empereroers des romains, et tint la victoires encontre les sarazinz et les henemis de sainte Yglise, et souzmist a sa seignorie Alemaigne et Espaigne et mainz autres païs].³³

In these two mid-thirteenth-century texts that circulated in Outremer, Charlemagne's actions on behalf of the church were cast neither as crusading or even pre-crusading efforts, but rather as part of the king's aims to bolster Christianity in the West, whether in France, Italy, or the Roman Empire. Contemporary texts in the West had firmly placed Charlemagne in the eastern arena, yet no such connections were made in the Levant where Charlemagne was instead viewed as a western champion.

Canonical Charlemagne Texts in Outremer

Although the previous section focused on western texts known to have circulated in the Levant, it is important also to take a brief but close look at whether copies of the canonical texts forming the foundation of the Charlemagne story circulated in the Crusader East. Among the most influential of these are Einhard's *Vita Karoli*,³⁴ the *Gesta Karoli Magni* by Notker the Stammerer, and the Saxon Poet's *Life of Charles the Great*

³¹ Fabio Zinelli identifies them as Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale de France, fonds français 2024 (ms Y); London, British Library, Additional 30024 (ms C²); Carpentras, Bibliothèque Imguibertine, 269 (ms C³), and Torino, Biblioteca Nazionale e Universitaria 1643 [L II 18] (ms To). "Sur les traces de l'atelier des chansonniers occitans ik: le manuscrit de Vérone, biblioteca capitonarel, DVIII et la tradition méditerranéenne du Livres dou tresor," *Medioevo romanzo* 31 (2007): 7–69, at 21.

³² Brunetto Latini, *Trésor*, ed. Pietro Beltrami et al. (Turin: G. Einaudi, 2007), 70.

³³ Latini, *Trésor*, 120–21.

³⁴ Matthias M. Tischler, *Einhard's Vita Karoli: Studien zur Entstehung, Überlieferung und Rezeption* (Hannover: Hahnsche Buchhandlung, 2001), 17–44.

(*Annales de gestis Caroli magni imperatoris libro quinque*).³⁵ Many more could be cited, but here we add only two more, the so-called *Pseudo Turpin*, because it circulated so widely throughout Western Europe, and the Liturgy of St Charlemagne, since western liturgical practices were influential in the context of the public and political life of the Crusader States.³⁶

And yet again, there is little to relate. Of the over 130 manuscripts containing Einhard's *Vita Karoli*, transcribed as early as the ninth until as late as the seventeenth century, none seem to have travelled to or originated in the East.³⁷ Similarly, the twenty-five pre-sixteenth-century manuscripts of Notker the Stammerer's *Gesta Karoli Magni* were copied in areas throughout the West, in modern-day Austria, France, and Germany, and not, seemingly, in the East, although certain copies remain unlocalized.³⁸ The Saxon Poet's work appears in only two manuscripts, neither of which have ties to Outremer.³⁹ The Pseudo-Turpin text was translated from Latin into multiple vernaculars and is currently found in over 300 manuscripts, yet none of these copies has yet been localized to the Levant, despite its wide circulation in modern day Spain, Italy, France, Germany, Britain, and Scandinavia.⁴⁰ Finally, the calendars of saints in liturgical manuscripts coming from Outremer bear no evidence of the king's name, even in those tables created after the time of Charlemagne's canonization by Frederick Barbarossa in the mid-twelfth century, perhaps since liturgical celebrations of the Emperor remained highly localized to the areas around Aachen.⁴¹

All that may be said from the current state of the question is that knowledge of the canonical Charlemagne texts appears to have been only second-hand in the Levant. This was the case with William of Tyre's

³⁵ For this list, see note 7 above. Notker der Stammler, *Taten Kaiser Karls des Grossen*, ed. Hans F. Haefele, Monumenta Germaniae Historica, Scriptores Rerum Germanicarum, Nova Series, 12 (Berlin: Weidmann, 1959).

³⁶ Sebastián Salvadó, "Performing Sacrality: The Liturgical Portrait of Frederick Barbarossa's Charlemagne," in *The Charlemagne Legend in Medieval Latin Texts*, ed. William J. Purkis and Matthew Gabriele (Cambridge: D. S. Brewer, 2016), 59–91; Jace Stuckey, "The Twelfth-Century *Vita Karoli* and the Making of a Royal Saint," in *The Charlemagne Legend*, 33–58; Michael McGrade, "O rex mundi triumphator: Hohenstaufen Politics in a Sequence for Saint Charlemagne," *Early Music History* 17 (1998): 183–219.

³⁷ Tischler, *Einhard's Vita Karoli*, 17–44.

³⁸ Notker der Stammler, xxvi–xli; Haefele notes at xxvii–xxviii, for example, that the provenance for ms H, Hanover, Gottfried Wilhelm Leibniz Library, XIII 858, remains uncertain.

³⁹ Poeta Saxo, *Annalium de gestis beati Caroli Magni libri quinque*, ed. Paul Winterfield, Monumenta Germaniae Historica, Poetae Latini Aevi Carolini 4/1, (Berlin: Weidmann, 1899), 2–6.

⁴⁰ André de Mandach, *Naissance et développement de la chanson de geste en Europe, vol. 1, La geste de Charlemagne et de Roland* (Geneva, Droz and Paris: Minard, 1961), 364–98.

⁴¹ Dondi, *Liturgy of the Canons Regular*, 255–302; Robert Folz, *Études sur le culte liturgique de Charlemagne dans les églises de l'Empire* (Paris: Les Belles Lettres, 1951). More work on the presence of Charlemagne in liturgical sources from the East should be undertaken, though it is beyond the scope of this essay.

integration of Einhard's work into his own historical narrative, and with the themes found first in recognizable Charlemagne texts that reappeared in later works, including those by Gautier de Metz and Brunetto Latini. Charlemagne's reputation may have been known in Outremer, but texts that established him in the West were not frequently copied into manuscripts produced or circulated in the East.

Conflation Perpetuated: Charlemagne in Outremer

A robust literary tradition in the West, which began even prior to the First Crusade, had identified Charlemagne as a pilgrim and defender of the Christian faith in the Holy Land. Certain stories told in the Latin West and associated with a certain attitude to the East, from the *Descriptio qualiter Karolus Magnus* to the *Pèlerinage à Jérusalem*, described Charlemagne's adventures in the Holy Land in great detail, even if the Emperor himself never made the trip.⁴² Western arguments for Charlemagne's role in the East continued well into the nineteenth century, when in 1885, Hospitaller scholar Joseph Delaville le Roulx dispelled claims that Charlemagne was the real founder of the Order, even if no such assertions were made by the fourteenth-century brothers or any of their predecessors.⁴³ In his late nineteenth-century *Regesta regni Hierosolymitani*, Reinhold Röhrich identified as a forgery a charter dated to 1 January 1099, which named Charlemagne as a pre-cursor to Godfrey of Bouillon, the first western ruler of the Kingdom of Jerusalem.⁴⁴

Charlemagne's impact on readers in Outremer during the crusading period seems to have been residual rather than direct, even if western literary traditions maintained and perpetuated an entirely different vision. Charlemagne's reputation as a founder was so entrenched in the West, it seems, that we have overlooked the foundation narratives found in the texts created in the Crusader States, preferring to believe that Charlemagne's legend performed that duty in the East as well. Because Charlemagne was largely invisible to readers in the East, we now must ask how the same values

⁴² Instead, Charlemagne sent an envoy to survey the state of the churches in the Holy Land. Michael McCormick, *Charlemagne's Survey of the Holy Land: Wealth, Personnel, and Buildings of a Mediterranean Church between Antiquity and the Middle Ages* (Washington, D. C.: Dumbarton Oaks Research Library and Collection, 2011). For more western versions of Charlemagne in the East, see Danielle Quérue, "De l'épopée à la chronique: Charlemagne premier croisé français," in *Chanter de geste: l'art épique et son rayonnement: hommage à Jean-Claude Vallecalle/études recueillies par Marylène Possamai-Perez et Jean-René Valette* (Paris: Honoré Champion), 387–99.

⁴³ *De prima origine Hospitaliariorum Hierosolymitanorum* (Paris: no publisher, 1855), 75–80.

⁴⁴ *Revised Regesta Regni Hierosolymitani Database*, http://crusades-regesta.com/database?search_api_views_fulltext=charlemagne&field_institution_recipient=&field_grantor=&field_receipient=&field_year_1=&field_year=&field_term_type_field_term_title (accessed 25 June 2018).

that were embodied in the figure of Charlemagne and received by communities of readers in the West were in turn represented, communicated, and understood by the literate communities of the Latin East. Even though the writings created in the West visibly and fervently placed Charlemagne in the Holy Land, they may be occluding our view of how Charlemagne's story was retold within the literate communities of Outremer.

Bibliography

Primary Sources

- Baldwin III. *Historia Nicaena vel Antiochena necnon Ierosolymitana*. In *Recueil des historiens des croisades, historiens occidentaux*, Vol. 5, 133–85. Paris: Imprimerie nationale, 1895.
- Bartolf of Nangis. *Gesta Francorum Iherusalem expugnantium*. In *Recueil des historiens des croisades, historiens occidentaux*, Vol. 3, 491–543. Paris: Imprimerie nationale, 1866.
- Brunetto Latini. *Trésor*, edited by Pietro Beltrami et al. Turin: G. Einaudi, 2007. *The Chanson des Chétifs and Chanson de Jérusalem*. Translated by Carol Sweetenham. Farnham: Ashgate, 2016.
- Chronicle of the Third Crusade: A Translation of the Itinerarium peregrinorum et gesta Regis Ricardi*. Translated by Helen J. Nicholson. Farnham: Ashgate, 1997.
- Chronique d'Ernoult et de Bernard le Trésorier*. Edited by L. de Mas Latrie. Paris: Société de l'histoire de France, 1871.
- De prima origine Hospitaliariorum Hierosolymitanorum*. Edited by Joseph Delaville le Roulx. Paris: no publisher, 1855.
- Einhard. *Vita Karoli Magni*. In *Monumenta Germaniae historica. Scriptores rerum Germanicarum in usum scholarum separatim editi*, 25. Edited by Oswald Holder-Egger. Hannover: Hahn, 1911.
- Gautier de Metz. *L'image du monde de maître Gossouin: texte du manuscrit de la Bibliothèque nationale, fonds français n° 574*. Edited by Oliver Herbert Prior. Lausanne: Imprimeries réunies, 1913.
- Gesta Francorum et aliorum Hierosolimitanorum*. Edited and translated by Rosalind Hill. London: Thomas Nelson and Sons LTD, 1962.
- Guillaume de Tyr et ses continuateurs: texte français du XIII^e siècle*. Edited by Paulin Paris. Paris: Firmin Didot et cie, 1879–80.
- Notker der Stammler. *Taten Kaiser Karls des Grossen*. In *Monumenta Germaniae Historica. Scriptores Rerum Germanicarum, Nova Series*, 12. Edited by Hans F. Haefele. Berlin: Weidmann, 1959.
- Philippe de Novare. *Mémoires, 1218–1243*. Edited by Charles Kohler. Paris: H. Champion, 1913.
- Poeta Saxo. *Annalium de gestis beati Caroli Magni libri quinque*. Edited by Paul Winterfield, *Monumenta Germaniae Historica Poetae Latini Aevi Carolini* 4/1, 1–72. Berlin: Weidmann, 1899.

- Ralph of Caen. *The Gesta Tancredi of Ralph of Caen: A History of the Normans on the First Crusade*. Translated by Bernard S. Bachrach and David S. Bachrach. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2005.
- Rorgo Fretellus de Nazareth et sa description de la Terre Sainte. *Histoire et édition du texte*. Edited by P. C. Boren. Amsterdam, Oxford and New York: North Holland Publishing Company, 1980.
- William of Tyre. *A History of Deeds Done Beyond the Sea*. Edited and translated by Emily Atwater Babcock and August C. Krey. New York: Columbia University Press, 1943.

Secondary Sources

- Ailes, Marianne. "Les Reliques dans les chansons de geste." In *La chanson de geste et le sacre*. Clermont-Ferrand: Presse de l'Université Blaise-Pascal, forthcoming.
- Bandt, Cordula and Rattmann, Arnd. "Die Damaskusreise Bruno Violets 1900/1901 zur Erforschung der Qubbet el-Chazne." *Codices Manuscripti* 32/76–77 (2011): 1–20.
- Buchta, Hugo. *Miniature Painting in the Latin Kingdom of Jerusalem*. Oxford: Clarendon, 1957.
- Ciggaar, Krijnie. "Manuscripts as Intermediaries: The Crusader States and Literary Cross-Fertilization." In *East and West in the Crusader States: Context, Contacts, Confrontations: Acta of the Congress Held at Hernen Castle in May 1993*, edited by Krijnie Ciggaar, Adelbert Davids and Herman Teule, 131–51. Leuven: Uitgeverij Peeters, 1996.
- Dondi, Cristina. *The Liturgy of the Canons Regular of the Holy Sepulchre of Jerusalem. A Study and a Catalogue of the Manuscript Sources*. Turnhout: Brepols, 2004.
- Edbury, Peter. "Crusader Sources from the Near East." In *Byzantines and Crusaders in Non-Greek Sources, 1025–1204* edited by Mary Whitby, 23–38. Oxford and New York: Published for the British Academy by Oxford University Press, 2007.
- Folda, Jaroslav. *The Art of the Crusaders in the Holy Land, 1098–1187*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995.
- . *Crusader Illumination at Saint-Jean d'Acre, 1275–1291*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1976.
- . "manoscritti miniati negli stati crociati." In *Le crociate. L'Oriente e l'Occidente da Urbano II a San Luigi, 1096–1270*. Edited by M. Rey-Delque, 299–305. Milan: Electa, 1997.
- Folz, Robert. *Études sur le culte liturgique de Charlemagne dans les églises de l'Empire*. Paris: Les Belles Lettres, 1951.
- Gabriele, Matthew. *An Empire of Memory: The Legend of Charlemagne, the Franks, and Jerusalem before the First Crusade*. Oxford and New York: Oxford University Press, 2011.

- Glick, Leonard B. *Marked in Your Flesh: Circumcision from Ancient Judea to Modern America*. Oxford and New York: Oxford University Press, 2005.
- Handyside, Philip. "L'Estoire d'Eracles in Outremer." In *The French of Outremer: Communities and Communications in the Crusading Mediterranean*. Edited by Laura K. Morreale and Nicholas L. Paul, 68–85. New York: Fordham University Press, 2018.
- Jacoby, David. "La Littérature française dans les états latins de la Méditerranée orientale à l'époque des croisades: diffusion et création." In *Essor et fortune de la chanson de geste dans l'Europe et l'Orient latin: actes du IX^e Congrès international de la Société Rencesvals pour l'étude des épopées romanes, Padoue-Venise, 29 août–4 septembre 1982*, 617–46. Modena: Mucchi, 1984.
- LePerson, Marc. "'Autour du pont de Mautrible': souvenirs, mouvances et résurgences de la chanson de Fierabras dans différents genres du domaine français et étranger." In *La Mémoire à l'oeuvre: fixations et mouvances médiévales*, 133–62. Edited by Caroline Cazanave. Besançon: Presses universitaires de Franche-Comte, 2013.
- Mandach, André de. *Naissance et développement de la chanson de geste en Europe, vol. 1, La geste de Charlemagne et de Roland*. Geneva, Droz and Paris: Minard, 1961.
- McCormick, Michael. *Charlemagne's Survey of the Holy Land: Wealth, Personnel, and Buildings of a Mediterranean Church between Antiquity and the Middle Ages*. Washington, D. C.: Dumbarton Oaks Research Library and Collection, 2011.
- McGrade, Michael. "O rex mundi triumphator: Hohenstaufen Politics in a Sequence for Saint Charlemagne." *Early Music History* 17 (1998): 183–219.
- Minervini, Laura. "Sui frammenti epici della moschea di Damasco (Fierabras, l'asse 106–108, 117–118)." In *Codici, testi, interpretazioni: studi sull'epica romanza medievale*. Edited by Paolo Di Luca and Dorianna Piacentino, 93–103. Naples: University Press, 2015.
- Noble, Thomas F. X. "Greatness Contested and Confirmed: The Raw Materials of the Charlemagne Legend." In *The Legend of Charlemagne in the Middle Ages: Power, Faith, and Crusade*. Edited by Matthew Gabriele and Jace Stuckey, 3–21. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2008.
- D'Ottone, Arianna. "Manuscripts as Mirrors of a Multilingual and Multicultural Society: The Case of the Damascus Find." In *Negotiating Co-Existence: Communities, Cultures and "Convivencia" in Byzantine Society*. Edited by Barbara Crosini and Sergio LaPorta, 63–88. Trier: WVT, Wissenschaftlicher Verlag Trier, 2013.
- Tischler, Matthias M. *Einharts Vita Karoli: Studien zur Entstehung, Überlieferung und Rezeption*. Hannover: Hahnsche Buchhandlung, 2001.
- Rubenstein, Jay. "What is the *Gesta Francorum* and who was Peter Tudebode?" *Revue Mabillon* 16 (2005): 179–204.
- Salvadó, Sebastián. "Performing Sacrality: The Liturgical Portrait of Frederick Barbarossa's Charlemagne." In *The Charlemagne Legend in Medieval Latin*

- Texts*, edited by William J. Purkis and Matthew Gabriele, 59–91. Cambridge: D. S. Brewer, 2016.
- Stuckey, Jace. “The Twelfth-Century *Vita Karoli* and the Making of a Royal Saint.” In *The Charlemagne Legend in Medieval Latin Texts*. Edited by William J. Purkis and Matthew Gabriele, 33–58. Cambridge: D. S. Brewer, 2016.
- . “Charlemagne as Crusader? Memory, Propaganda, and the Many Uses of Charlemagne’s Legendary Expedition to Spain.” In *The Legend of Charlemagne in the Middle Ages: Power, Faith, and Crusade*. Edited by Matthew Gabriele and Jace Stuckey, 137–52. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2008.
- Quérueil, Danielle. “De l’épopée à la chronique: Charlemagne premier croisé français.” In *Chanter de geste: l’art épique et son rayonnement: hommage à Jean-Claude Vallecalle / études recueillies par Marylène Possamaï-Perez et Jean-René Valette*, 387–99. Paris: Honoré Champion.
- Zinelli, Fabio. “Sur les traces de l’atelier des chansonniers occitanais: le manuscrit de Vérone, biblioteca capitonarel, DVIII et la tradition méditerranéenne du Livre du trésor.” *Medioevo romanzo* 31 (2007): 7–69.

Digital Sources

- Huon de Saint-Quentin. “Jerusalem se plaint et li país,” Translated by Linda Paterson, with Ruth Harvey. *Troubadours, Trouvères and the Crusades*. Accessed 25 June 2018.
<https://warwick.ac.uk/fac/arts/modernlanguages/research/french/crusades/texts/of/rs1576#page1>. Accessed 25 June 2018.
- “Index of Sources.” *French of Outremer*. Accessed 25 June 2018.
<https://frenchofoutramer.ace.fordham.edu/index-of-sources/>.
- Philip of Novara “Nafre sui je, mais encor ne puis taire.” *Troubadours, Trouvères and the Crusades*. Accessed 25 June 2018.
<http://www2.warwick.ac.uk/fac/arts/modernlanguages/research/french/crusades/texts/of/rs190a/#page1>.
- “Online Inventory of the Manuscripts Owned by the Custody of the Holy Land in Jerusalem.” *Biblioteca Generale della Custodia di Terra Santa*. Accessed 25 June 2018.
<http://www.bibliothecaterraesanctae.org/descrizione-inventario-manoscritti.html>.
- Revised Regesta Regni Hierosolymitani Database*. Accessed 25 June 2018.
<http://crusades-regesta.com/>.