Urban-rural migration, social segregation and ethnic enclaves in a world city: London

Richard Harris, School of Geographical Sciences, University of Bristol
Some Themes

• Migration (urban to suburban to rural)
• Segregation (‘ethnic enclaves’)
• Immigration

• Defining the character of London as a multicultural world city
Some Themes

- Migration (urban to suburban to rural)
- Segregation (‘ethnic enclaves’)
- Immigration

- Defining the character of London as a multicultural world city
Robbie: This report does not take into account the big picture. Mass immigration is not just measured in how much tax an immigrant pays compared to the benefits claimed. The big picture needs to account for the affect that the immigrants have on accommodation where prices are forced up due to huge demand. The cost on schools, hospitals, etc. all services that have to expand to meet the growing population.
Some themes

• Quantification
• Computation
• Visualization
Some themes

• Quantification
• Computation
• Visualization
• “I keep saying that the sexy job in the next 10 years will be statisticians, and I’m not kidding.” – Hal Varian, chief economist at Google

• “In God we trust. All others must bring data.” – W. Edwards Deming, statistician

• “The goal is to turn data into information, and information into insight.” – Carly Fiorina, former executive, president, and chair of Hewlett-Packard Co.

Everything begins with a map…

www.social-statistics.org
Here’s some data: number of persons White British

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Region</th>
<th>2001</th>
<th>2011</th>
<th>Change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>England</td>
<td>42,747,136</td>
<td>42,279,236</td>
<td>- 1.09 % points</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>London</td>
<td>4,287,861</td>
<td>3,669,284</td>
<td>- 14.4 % points</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>London (all)</td>
<td>7,172,091</td>
<td>8,173,941</td>
<td>+ 14.0 % points</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The geography of the White British

Distribution of ethnic group by boroughs, counties and unitary authorities

White: English/Welsh/Scottish/Northern Irish/British

% White
< 71.5
< 88.5
< 93.6
< 94.4
< ...

Greatest percentage in Redcar and Cleveland
Greatest contrast between Redbridge and Essex

(c) Creative Commons Licence, Rich Harris
Ethnic enclaves in London?

• There is a geography to where different ethnic groups lives in London
  • Reflects historical patterns of immigration, current employment opportunities and general preference to live with one’s own kin (at least, initially)

• Are these ‘enclaves’?
  • Finney and Simpson (2009) say it is a myth that minority groups want to live in segregated neighbourhoods.
Pakistani ‘hot spots’ (2001 & 2011)
Indian ‘hot spots’ (2001 & 2011)
Black Caribbean ‘hot spots’ (2001 & 2011)
White British ‘hot spots’ (2001 & 2011)
An aside…

• How do we create a map like those just shown?
Looking at the changes

• [https://docs.google.com/spreadsheet/ccc?key=0Asv32MJ5YGxydEtpYXFxS0pLclJtTlZQYlJWNjVxb3c&usp=sharing](https://docs.google.com/spreadsheet/ccc?key=0Asv32MJ5YGxydEtpYXFxS0pLclJtTlZQYlJWNjVxb3c&usp=sharing)

Some questions

• What is (ethnic) segregation?
• How can we measure it?
• If it exists, does it matter?
• Does England have ‘ghettos’ in the same way as the United States, for example?
Commentaries on the 2011 Census data

• Two strands
• Those that observe the decline of the White British population in cities
• Leads to language of ‘which flight’, ‘white avoidance’, etc.
• Those that talk about decreased segregation and more mixed neighbourhoods
Some headlines

• ‘White flight’ in UK as mass immigration leads to segregation (RT, May 6)
• “600,000 move out in decade of 'white flight' from London” (Mail Online, Feb 20)
• “Let's talk about the exodus of 600,000 whites from London - It is not wrong to discuss the cultural changes that large-scale immigration can cause, such as 'white flight' from certain areas in London” (The Telegraph, Feb 22)
London as a multicultural city

- Post-war immigration from the Commonwealth
- More recent immigration from the UK
- Immigration is an emotive and contested subject
London as evidence of a ‘tipping point’?

• “The invasion of charter group territory generally precipitates an outflow of charter group residents which continues steadily until the critical point is reached when the proportion of households from the invading minority group is large enough to precipitate a much faster exodus.”

  • Know & Pinch (2000: 231)
London as evidence of a ‘tipping point’?

• “The invasion of a charter group territory generally precipitates an outflow of charter group residents which continues steadily until the critical point is reached when the proportion of households from the invading minority group is large enough to precipitate a much faster exodus.”

• Know & Pinch (2000: 231)
Britons ‘self-segregate’ as white flight soars

Nicholas Hellen
Social Affairs Editor

A TREND of white people to the countryside and outer suburbs is creating an “ethnic cliff” dividing them from communities dominated by minorities.

The latest census data shows that London, Bedfordshire, and the London boroughs of Waltham Forest, Redbridge, and Hackney are among urban areas that have lost about as many white residents as they gained minority ones in the past decade. The same trend is true in other parts of the country.

The “white flight” phenomenon is even beginning to affect the historic town of Wokingham in Berkshire, which “once recently named the best place to bring up a family.” It lost 3% of its white British population during the past decade.

David Goodhart, director of Demos, a think tank, said: “All the evidence shows that Britain is becoming less racist, but this data indicates that white Britons are self-segregating by moving into areas in which they are the overwhelming majority.”

It said the trend could pose a threat because divided societies were less willing to share resources with their weaker members.

According to a national analysis of the census by Richard Herron, reader in quantitative geography at Bristol University, the number of white British-origin (England and Wales) residents living in England and Wales in 2001 and 2011 although the total population rose by 1.3 million. By contrast, the white British population of the neighboring West Berkshire area nearly 2% to 20% out of a total population of 1.7 million. Herron, a man, and his wife Sarah, who works as a councilor’s commissioner, moved from a block of flats in central Reading to the suburb of Calcot, West Berkshire, last spring, largely because of the fear of crime. “White people go out at night, because scared of walking as might be himself,” Herron said.

Robbie Fabb, 26, who moved with his Afghan family into the white couple’s former neighborhood in central Reading 30 years ago, said: “At that time we’ve noticed some white Britons people were amazing and foreign we move in. When we moved here those shops, there’s a fine as you don’t do by.”

The most dramatic example of white Britons took place in the northwest London borough of Harrow where the number of whites grew from 28,484 to 29,450 in a decade when the total population rose by 43,365 to 296,273. The white population of Harrow, nearly, rose 3% in the same period.

Goodhart said the phenomenon had gone largely unnoticed because the center of London has a majority white racial mix in shops, on public transport and others in the workplace. But he said white British people feared the “kinder congregating” described by “kinder segregation” if you followed, people home you would see them returning to areas that are heavily segregated. According to a Chatham House analysis titled “by Paul Davis, the former international security, more than 1.5 million do not have English as a first language.

Derek Morgan, professor of politics at Goldsmiths, University of London, who is working on a Demos research project on Britain’s changing population, said: “If the country doesn’t have hard borders, you may get people coming. On the other hand, you have to know the level of the state.”

---

The Saturday Times (Jan 27, 2013)
The Daily Mail online (Jan 27, 2013)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Location</th>
<th>2001</th>
<th>2011</th>
<th>fall/rise</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Reading</td>
<td>115,363</td>
<td>101,725</td>
<td>-11.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>West Berkshire</td>
<td>135,911</td>
<td>139,044</td>
<td>+2.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Redbridge</td>
<td>137,097</td>
<td>96,253</td>
<td>-30.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basildon Essex</td>
<td>147,753</td>
<td>157,983</td>
<td>+6.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Croydon</td>
<td>210,573</td>
<td>171,740</td>
<td>-4.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mid Sussex</td>
<td>119,218</td>
<td>126,341</td>
<td>+5.6%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

How it works: The white population in urban areas declines, while dramatically increasing in neighbouring rural ones.
‘Ethnic cliffs’

• Refers to the phenomenon of places with contrasting ethnic profiles existing side-by-side

• Happens at the small area scale too
For example…

- There is a small area in Hackney where 346 of the 640 population are White British (54%), 156 White other (24%), 14 Black (2%), 3 Asian Commonwealth (0.005%).

- Meanwhile, adjoining it is a small area where 30 of the 324 population are White British (9%), 49 White other (15%), 137 Black (42%), 48 Asian (15%).
White flight?

• It is important to understand that the proportion of white British Londoners fell so dramatically – from 60 per cent in 2001 to 44.9 per cent in 2011 – not only because of high levels of immigration but also thanks to a mass exodus of white Britons [...]
White flight?

• White flight is an emotive term that suggests discomfort with the changing racial composition of a neighbourhood. Clearly there are many reasons why white British people might want to leave London [...] but merely by considering where it is happening, there appears to be prima facie evidence that white flight has played a role.

• David Goodhart (Financial Times, Dec 26, 2012)
Or white avoidance?

• Not white flight but ‘white avoidance’
  • Demos report (Kaufman, 2013)
  • White British people choosing not to live in ‘minority-dominated areas’
  • Commenting on the report, the process is described as “majority retreat” by Trevor Philips (former chair of the Equality and Human Rights Commission)
Segregation is decreasing?

- Ethnic segregation is falling in England (Catney, 2013)
- A lower proportion of the White British population are now living in majority White neighbourhoods than did in 2001 – a finding that is as true of London alone as for the whole of England (Johnston et al., 2013)
Figure 1. Histograms of change in segregation, 2001-2011

- **White British**
  - Decrease (14%)
  - Increase (86%)

- **Other White**
  - Decrease (61%)
  - Increase (39%)

- **Mixed**
  - Decrease (71%)
  - Increase (29%)

- **Indian**
  - Decrease (71%)
  - Increase (29%)

- **Pakistani**
  - Decrease (64%)
  - Increase (36%)

- **Bangladeshi**
  - Decrease (53%)
  - Increase (47%)

- **Chinese**
  - Decrease (63%)
  - Increase (37%)

- **African**
  - Decrease (69%)
  - Increase (31%)

- **Caribbean**
  - Decrease (72%)
  - Increase (28%)

Notes: Purple bars show the proportion of districts with decreased segregation, and orange bars show the proportion of districts with increased segregation. The percentage of districts which have increased or decreased is shown in brackets.

Source:
Alternative perspectives (2)

• Migration and mobility?
  • To the BBC’s Home editor, Mark Easton, the decrease in the White British population in London is “a story of aspiration”, “a story of success” – a process of migration where traditionally working class (white) households have been financially able to move out from London’s East End, to the outer boroughs and then further beyond the city (Easton, 2013).
  • http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-21511904
The Burgess model of Chicago

Burgess et al., *The City* (1925)
Alternative perspectives (3)

• Why the preoccupation with White British?

  • Katwala (New Statements, Feb 20): “A fall in London’s ‘white British’ population does not mean the city is now ‘majority-migrant’”.
    • 63 per cent of Londoners were born in Britain
    • The population of London is 60 per cent white
    • Three-quarters of Londoners are British citizens
  • http://www.newstatesman.com/staggers/2013/02/truth-about-londons-white-flight
Alternative perspectives (4)

• Why the preoccupation with residential ‘segregation’? (cf. Cantle, 2012)?
  • What about schools?
  • Or workplaces?
Alternative perspectives (5)

• Assuming there is segregation, and supposing it is to some extent ‘voluntary’ does it matter?
• Indeed, might there be circumstances when it, for example, cultivates civic virtues that promote the good of one’s community
Alternative perspectives (6)

- Is it actually ethnic ‘segregation’ or social (i.e. by wealth and deprivation)?
- And is it caused by the individuals themselves or by structural factors?
Some questions

• Suppose that schools in London are more ethnically segregated than neighbourhoods (in fact, they are)
  • Should you do anything about it? Why?
  • What might you do about it?
  • Who would you actions affect most?
Commentaries on the 2011 Census data

• The strands are not necessarily in contradiction

• They may arise due to different processes (more mixing but also the contraction of the White British from some urban locations)

• Or even the same process (urban-suburban/rural) migration but differentially realised and therefore with different geographies for different ethnic groups.
For example

• Consider those local authorities (nationally) where the % of the residential population classified as Pakistani in 2001 was > 1.04% (top quintile)

• Of these, 92% have “decreased segregation” by 2011 (Of the exceptions, Burnley has the greatest increase)

• But, amongst those 92%, 88% have lost White British population
For example

• Consider those local authorities where the % of the residential population classified as Bangladeshi in 2001 was > 0.32% (top quintile)

• Of these, 94% have “decreased segregation” by 2011 (Of the exceptions, Kensington & Chelsea has the greatest increase)

• But, amongst those 94%, 84% have lost White British population
• It’s not just because the White British population is decreasing everywhere (it isn’t)
• In the 214 (of 326) local authorities that didn’t meet any of the previous criteria, 81% had a growth in their White British population
• Data are not neutral.
• They are political.
• And they are always debatable.
• “We do not have segregation in any shape or form in the UK" (Peter Herbert, Society of Black Lawyers).
  • Quoted at http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-24147027
• Sir Robin Wales [mayor of Newham] has spoken of his aim to prevent “apartheid” in Newham by pushing integration between communities.
  • http://www.newhamrecorder.co.uk/news/newham_mayor_defends_community_integration_plan_on_bbc_newsnight_1_2768586
Here, for me, is the dilemma…
Wordle of the comments in response to the Daily Mail online article
Wordle of the highest rated comments on the Mark Easton article
‘Highly rated’ comment in response to the Mark Easton article

• Why have the White British left London?

  • “Some of the Areas have become very Asian oriented with shops that cater more for Asian people Halal Butchers, Bangladeshi Bakers, Mosques and Temples, local shops that are dominated by Asian foods and spices, and that cater very little for non Asian tastes. Is it any wonder the White people move out? People feel like strangers in the town where they were born.”
Highest rated comment in response to the Mark Easton article

• Why have the White British left London?
  • “They have left because they've been pushed out by migrants. A few weeks ago we heard of some Islamic "men" castigating a man for not being Muslim, asking if he was gay, and telling him to "get out, this is a Muslim area". Their exact words were played on the radio so there was no doubt over it. Time for the govt. to do something about such migrants”
• You can also find evidence of similar (although not perhaps as strong) sentiments in (the respondents of) e.g.
  
  
White Flight, Ethnic Cliffs: Unhelpful hyperbole?

• Simplistic, certainly.
• Adds a rhetorical flourish of terror, panic, stark divides, etc.
• Ignore other demographic and social processes

• And yet...
Some (final) questions

• Is it right (or responsible) to talk about ethnic segregation in London or the UK? What might be some of the problems with the term?

• What do you think about phrases like white flight or white avoidance?

• Is it right to make the connection between demographic changes and immigration?