

chair (2004–9). Involved in studying women's peace activism in Israel since 1985, she has published widely on ethnicity, gender, social movements, peace studies, sociology of emotions and transgender dynamics. *Address*: Department of Behavioural Sciences, The College of Management-Academic Studies, 7 Rabin Blvd, POB 9153, Rishon Lezion, 75190, Israel. Email: tovabenski@gmail.com

Adi Ophir, Michal Givoni and Sari Hanafi (eds),  
*The Power of Inclusive Exclusion: Anatomy of Israeli Rule in the Occupied Palestinian Territories*,  
Brooklyn, NY: Zone Books, 2009; 643 pp.: ISBN 9781890951924, US\$38.95

**Reviewed by** Vincent Romani, *University of Quebec at Montreal, Canada*

### **Keywords**

colonization, Israel, military occupation, Palestine

Beginning in September 2000 with the uprising in the Occupied Palestinian Territories (OPT), dramatic events deeply reshaped the Palestinian political landscape. In 2004, Yasser Arafat, head of the Palestinian national movement's main institutions for decades, passed away. More than 1000 Israelis and 6000 Palestinians – mostly non-combatants from both sides – have been killed since 2000, and this number continues to rise. One last element of this chain of events is the geopolitical partition of the OPT, between a Hamas-administered Gaza Strip, and a Fatah-administered West Bank under the control of the Israeli army. Increased poverty, coercion, fragmentation, colonization and hopelessness still frame the daily life of Palestinians in the OPT.

Throughout these changes, what is remarkable is the continuity of the OPT's military administration by Israel. Often presented or imagined as temporary, this occupation has always been criticized or praised for its political aims, means and effects, as the editors put it (pp. 15–27). It has rarely been analysed as a coherent and long-lasting system enshrined in the Israeli political system and as a subjugating weld between two societies. Yet this system has been in place for 44 years, since the invasion of 1967. The impressive work of Adi Ophir, Michal Givoni and Sari Hanafi is based on this main hypothesis of continuity. This hypothesis not only addresses the chronological dimension, but also its spatial one: it considers the occupation as part of one complex territorial system. This means that for the sake of the analysis, the authors apply theoretically the 'one-state solution': its explanatory success illustrates the range of the current empirical failure of the Palestinian national movement aspiring to separate statehood.

The very title of the book is brilliant, capturing this extraordinary historical paradox of a multidimensional process of demographic inclusion and democratic exclusion of the Palestinians in/from the Israeli polity. The 18 authors who have contributed to the book help us to grasp the political oxymoron of ever growing and deeper control of the Palestinian population by the Israeli army, in a context albeit framed by the opposite prospect of an independent Palestinian state, and by the reality of ethnic separation. Indeed, it consists of a successful attempt of thinking about the occupation as a coherent

and stabilized regime of power. It raises a medium-range perspective because it does not address the Israeli political system, nor does it focus on the long-term effects of the occupation on Palestinian society, except the chapters by Sari Hanafi ('Palestinian refugee camps in the Palestinian territory'), Caroline Abu-Sada ('Cultivating dependence: Palestinian agriculture under Israeli occupation'), Leila Farsakh ('From domination to destruction: The Palestinian economy under Israeli occupation') and Neve Gordon and Dani Filc ('The destruction of risk society and the ascendancy of Hamas'). It rather addresses the scope, depth and functioning of the Israeli matrix of control which transforms Palestinians into subjects on a daily basis. Most of the chapters thus address the management of the military administration, from different points of view: legal (Ben-Naftali, Gross, Michaeli), historical (Shenhav and Berda, Handel), geographical (Azoulay, Handel), sociological (Shamir, Gordon and Filc, Ophir), economic (Farsakh, Abu-Sada, Algazi), military (Weizman) and political (Gordon and all others). In itself, the cast of authors illustrates the book's idea of asymmetry and separation: there are only three Palestinian authors, who live and work outside Palestine-Israel.

This intriguing set of essays sketches a broad and deep picture of Israeli rule in the OPT. The asymmetric relationship between Israel and the Palestinians is not only understood at a macro-social level. The reader is also told about the micro-management tools used by the Israeli administration: we discover the intimacy of this matrix of control and also its subjective dimensions. The authors help us to understand how Israel controls social time and individual time, less through direct coercion than through the use of opacity and arbitrariness, leading to a major existential uncertainty (Azoulay and Ophir on 'The order of violence', Shamir about 'Occupation as disorientation: The impossibility of borders' and Gordon and Filc especially). In doing so, they open the black box of the military administration, which floats like a permanent and virtual ghost upon the existence of the Palestinians, ruling their lives and hopes, but from far away, by proxies and through residual points of contact. The unpredictable bureaucratic apparatus, the fragmentation of space, and the regulation of movements through an opaque tapestry of laws are exposed at length. Neve Gordon, in his recently published *Israeli Occupation* as well as in his chapter, 'From colonization to separation: Exploring the structure of Israel's occupation', rightly explains the turning point of the 1987–92 Palestinian uprising, when the separation regime was brought by Israel against the previous colonization regime, but failed to replace it and instead was juxtaposed to it thanks to the Oslo process. Here is Arnon Soffer's nightmare, the Israeli theorist of the 'colonization threshold', who as early as the 1970s warned Israeli governments against the deadlock of a mechanism that seizes lands but refuses its inhabitants.

Drawing on Foucault, the use by Adi Ophir and colleagues of the notion of a 'regime' in order to analyse the occupation is both useful and somewhat troubling. It helps to explain Israeli rule as a structure, and it brings to our attention the intimate, subjective, micro-sociological, chronological dimensions of power. By straying from the classical top-down meaning of regimes in political science, it also disperses the locations of violence through a multitude of places, times and agents: it answers the question 'how violence is exerted' rather than 'who defines or decides it'. The authors barely relate the Israeli political system to the regime they define, leading to the impression of a sum of

unintended effects of numerous local agents and actions, more than a broad intentional, coherent plan, and more like a floating structure between Israel and the Palestinians. If we face an ex-post rationalization of irrational policies, the enlargement of the notion of 'regime' may lose some of its relevance. Except for Gadi Algazi's chapter about the relations between the village of Bil'in and the settlement of Modi'in Illit, little is said about the settlers: the system of settlements, consisting of around 500,000 people if one includes Jerusalem, bears a detrimental role in the occupation, and there is a need to open this other black box as brightly as the authors do with other dimensions of the occupation. For obvious reasons of forbidden access, the specificity of the Gaza Strip's fate is not documented, although many chapters of the book could apply to it.

This book completes a new type of literature on Israel–Palestine, born out of the 2000 uprising which shattered the hope for a political settlement and destroyed many Palestinian institutions of the Oslo era.

Social scientists, in particular political scientists, were suddenly deprived of large theoretical frameworks (state, state-building, state formation, etc.), and were forced towards refined, micro-sociological, anthropological methods and theories. This perhaps explains the appeal to Foucault and his model of disseminated power in this book. While one of the main ideas of the book is to bypass warfare in order to stress the continuity of occupation, the seemingly divergent and fascinating chapter by Eyal Weizman, about 'Thanato-tactics' is nevertheless necessary. It highlights the cold military machinery of the administration of death, constructed by its actors as a 'lesser evil'. It means that the policy of 'targeted killings' is marketed as a humanitarian tool that prevents full-scale wars, and ultimately allows the daily administration of occupation through trivialized violence.

Ophir, Givoni and Hanafi's publication stands out from the body of literature about Palestine–Israel for its creativity and richness: it encompasses indeed four projects, and one only regrets the absence of an index. The first project consists in the editing of the aforementioned 13 written chapters. The second project is an exhibition of documents produced by the military administration, through a 10-stage 'occupation's paper trail' organized by Michal Givoni: 'Considering the opacity of the occupation regime'. This archiving project succeeds in fleshing out the story for the incredulous reader. The third project gives another raw sense of reality through five black and white 'photo dossiers', captured, organized and commented on by Ariela Azoulay in a very researched and dry manner. The fourth project consists in a 31-page chronology of the occupation, from 1967 until 2007, researched by Ariel Handel, which gives another blunt insight into the violence, depth and changing patterns of the occupation. Besides its richness, courage and creativity, one could also characterize this work as beautiful despite the sinister object and perspective it succeeds in explaining to the reader.

Vincent Romani is Professor of Political Science at the University of Quebec at Montreal (UQAM) and director of the Center for Middle East and North African Studies. His research focuses on the dynamics of power and knowledge in the Middle East. His forthcoming book, *Les Sciences sociales palestiniennes entre engagement national et coercition* [Palestinian social sciences between national commitment and coercion] (Karthala, 2012), analyses the developments of the social sciences, higher education and social scientists in the Occupied Palestinian Territories. Address: Département de Science Politique, UQÀM, Case postale 8888, succ. Centre-Ville, Montréal (Québec) H3C 3P8, Canada. Email: romani.vincent@uqam.ca